

001 3123
AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

AD HOC IAC COMMITTEE (WATCH)

Minutes of Meeting Held in Director's
Conference Room, Administration Building
Central Intelligence Agency, on 29 January 1954

Mr. Huntington D. Sheldon
Presiding

MEMBERS PRESENT

Mr. William C. Trueheart, Office of the Special Assistant,
Intelligence, Department of State
Brigadier General John M. Willems, Deputy AC of S, G-2,
Department of the Army
Captain D. T. Eller (USN), Assistant Head, Intelligence
Branch, ONI, Department of the Navy
Brigadier General Millard Lewis, Deputy Director Intelli-
gence, Headquarters USAF, United States Air Force
Dr. Charles H. Reichardt, Intelligence Division, Atomic
Energy Commission
Colonel Neil M. Wallace, Joint Intelligence Group, The
Joint Staff (Substitute for Rear Admiral E. T. Layton)
Mr. Meffert W. Kuhrtz, Special Agent, Liaison Section,
Federal Bureau of Investigation

ALSO PRESENT

Lt. Col. James P. Barry, Department of the Army
Cdr. Robert B. Kail, Department of the Navy
Col. George R. Hundt, United States Air Force
Col. Howard D. Kenzie, United States Air Force
Mr. Samuel S. Rockwell, United States Air Force

25X1A

Secretary

Document No. <u>11</u>
No Change In Class. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
<input type="checkbox"/> Declassified
Class. Changed to: TS S C
Next Review Date: <u>1989</u>
Auth.: HR 70-3
Date: <u>26/2/79</u> By: <u>19360</u>

CONFIDENTIAL

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

The CHAIRMAN called for comments on the minutes of the tenth meeting as distributed.

CAPTAIN ELLER asked that the next to last line of his statement appearing on page 3 be changed to read "that there had been times when certain intelligence items having operational aspects had not been presented."

The CHAIRMAN, on receiving no further comments, said that the minutes stood approved as distributed and amended.

The SECRETARY circulated copies of CIA's proposals for paragraphs to be included in the list of duties of the Working Group and/or Watch Committee.

The CHAIRMAN referred to the list of duties proposed by G-2, and stated that CIA was prepared to approve the G-2 paragraph dealing with the selection of indications provided the concept expressed in CIA's proposal for Paragraph h was approved by the Ad Hoc Committee. It read:

"prepare material for use by the Watch Committee as the basis for its deliberations and the formulation of its conclusions."

DR. REICHARDT pointed out that the paragraph gave leeway to the individual Watch Committee members.

COLONEL WALLACE stated that in practice members of the present Watch Committee never felt restricted because of a printed agenda.

LT. COLONEL BARRY (temporarily sitting for General Willems) said that he favored the statement in that it avoided specifying exact mechanics and left the detailed decision to the Watch Committee as to the manner in which things were done. At the same time, the paragraph provided for flexibility in staff operation.

CAPTAIN ELLER said that he had not been willing to have the Working Group predraft the Watch Committee report and conclusions. He suggested that the words "as a basis for" be changed to "to assist in" as this would show clearly that there was no intent that the Watch report and conclusions were to be written preliminarily.

The CHAIRMAN determined that this change was acceptable to the Committee, and stated that the paragraph as tentatively approved reads:

"prepare material for use by the Watch Committee to assist in its deliberations and the formulation of its conclusions."

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

CONFIDENTIAL

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

He asked if there were any comments on Paragraph g which read:

"coordinate with the individual members of the Watch Committee the selection of indications for consideration by the Committee in regular and special meetings."

He determined that this was tentatively approved by the Committee as presented.

He asked for comments on Paragraph i which read:

"coordinate the reproduction and distribution of the Watch Committee reports in final form."

He recommended that the paragraph be tightened up by being changed to read:

"coordinate the reproduction and dissemination of approved Watch Committee reports."

This was tentatively approved by the Committee.

He asked for comments on the CIA proposal for Paragraph j. This paragraph read:

"concurrently, but not as a substitute for current methods of analysis and evaluation, to develop experimentally and test mechanical aids and techniques with a view eventually to assist in accomplishing the Watch Committee mission."

GENERAL WILLEMS said that the Watch Committee should have the advantage of modern developments, yet should not be bound to adopt devices regardless of their usefulness just for the sake of having them.

DR. REICHARDT pointed out that if something is developed experimentally, testing is included as a matter of course.

COLONEL WALLACE suggested that the wording be changed to "...develop and test mechanical aids and techniques on an experimental basis..."

CAPTAIN ELLER pointed out that the Watch Committee should not enter the experiment and research field, and by so doing divert its attention from its primary mission.

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

CONFIDENTIAL

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

The CHAIRMAN determined, after further discussion by the Committee, that the paragraph was tentatively approved to read:

"concurrently, but not as a substitute for current methods of analysis and evaluation, develop and test mechanical aids and techniques on an experimental basis with a view to their eventual use in assisting effectively the Watch Committee in the accomplishment of its mission."

The CHAIRMAN asked for comments on the G-2 proposed Paragraph k which read:

"prepare plans for submission to the Watch Committee for systematizing, energizing, and coordinating the world-wide collection by US agencies of indications of Soviet-Communist preparations for attack."

He proposed that the paragraph be changed to read:

"develop and operate on a current and continuing basis the Watch Committee Intelligence Plan for systematizing, energizing and coordinating the world-wide collection by US agencies of intelligence pertinent to the Watch Committee mission."

GENERAL WILLEMS suggested that the Chairman's recommendation be changed to read: "...of indications intelligence pertinent to..."

CAPTAIN ELLER suggested that as neither the Watch Committee nor the Working Group should be involved in the actual mechanics of collection, that the words "through proper channels" be inserted after the word "coordinating".

GENERAL WILLEMS thought that "appropriate channels" might be better in that it would not tie the hands of the Committee in an emergency.

COLONEL WALLACE asked if the development of the Watch Committee Intelligence Plan was a function of the Watch Committee itself or was one of the duties of the Ad Hoc Committee.

The CHAIRMAN stated that it was not his view that the Ad Hoc Committee should write the Intelligence Plan. That, he said, was a duty of the Watch Committee, the Ad Hoc Committee being charged with pointing out to the Watch Committee that a plan, among other things, was required. He said that he had proposed the change in the paragraph under discussion as he felt that at some point it may be advisable for the staff to make recommendations to the Watch Committee that things be done, although it should be made clear that the Watch Committee makes its own decisions on the manner in which the Center is operated.

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

CONFIDENTIAL

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

He determined that it was the sense of the meeting that the paragraph would become Paragraph a, and subject to later review, would read:

"develop and operate on a current and continuing basis the Watch Committee Intelligence Plan for systematizing, energizing, and coordinating through appropriate channels the world-wide collection by US agencies of indications intelligence pertinent to the Watch Committee mission."

DR. REICHARDT recalled that at the tenth meeting it had been decided to complete the list of duties after which the Ad Hoc Committee would review them all to determine which were properly the responsibility of the Watch Committee and which of the Working Group. He said that he thought that the paragraph under discussion was actually a responsibility of the Watch Committee itself.

GENERAL WILLEMS pointed out that it was extremely difficult to differentiate between the duties of the Watch Committee and those of the Working Group as long as the two bodies are to work very closely together.

The CHAIRMAN instructed the Secretary to prepare a clean draft of the tentatively approved duties so that they might be reviewed at the next meeting of the Ad Hoc Committee.

He referred to CIA's "Proposed Draft Terms of Reference, IAC Watch Committee," dated 20 October 1953, and suggested that the Ad Hoc Committee address itself to the composition, membership, and location of the Watch Committee and the Working Group.

MR. TRUEHEART thought that the Ad Hoc Committee should consider first the location of the Indications Center as propinquity might have a bearing on the selection of a Chairman for the Watch Committee itself.

The CHAIRMAN proposed that the Indications Center be located in the Pentagon Building.

COLONEL WALLACE recalled that Paragraph 13 of the JIG proposal submitted to the Ad Hoc Committee at its first meeting on 30 October had recommended CIA as the proper location for an Indications Center.

The CHAIRMAN said that this was not acceptable to CIA.

CAPTAIN ELLER asked if there would be any advantage in having the Center close to the meeting place of the IAC.

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

CONFIDENTIAL

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

The CHAIRMAN replied that he saw no advantage therein, and pointed out that in critical periods the IAC itself might wish to meet in the Indications Center. He determined that it was the sense of the meeting that the Indications Center should be located in the Pentagon Building.

He quoted from the CIA 20 October proposal which stated that the Watch Committee should have - "a Chairman, to be appointed by the IAC for a specified period...", and said that in recognition of the fact that the Watch Committee must have maximum support from all IAC agencies, one of the best devices for ensuring such support was by having the Chairman rotate from time to time.

DR. REICHARDT said that he thought it would be unrealistic for the AEC to provide a Chairman.

MR. KUHZRTZ said that he favored leaving the matter open so that the IAC could select the most appropriate Chairman in light of world conditions, and said that he could visualize world developments that might make an AEC representative the most appropriate Chairman.

GENERAL WILLEMS questioned the desirability of requiring rotation as there might be instances when the IAC wished to appoint a particularly competent individual.

The CHAIRMAN spoke in favor of a stated rotation concept, and said that he felt that as the watch problem was primarily military, the Chairman normally should be drawn from the three Service agencies and the Joint Staff.

MR. TRUEHEART said that he thought the IAC should be free to decide on a Chairman on an ad hoc basis.

The CHAIRMAN pointed out that the CIA proposal left the matter open as to the method of selection of a Chairman as well as to the period for which he would serve.

CAPTAIN ELLER asked if it would be desirable to recommend a minimum and maximum assignment, and suggested not less than one year nor more than three years.

GENERAL WILLEMS said that to so specify would be legislating the IAC.

The CHAIRMAN, after further discussion by the Ad Hoc Committee, determined that the proposal "a Chairman, to be appointed by the IAC for a specified period" was tentatively approved.

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

He recalled that the discussion at the tenth meeting regarding the stature of individual Watch Committee members had been inconclusive.

GENERAL LEWIS outlined to the Committee his concept of the relationship between the Watch Committee and its Working Group on the one hand and the entire Intelligence effort on the other. He said that he visualized a considerable differential between representation in the Center and representation on the Watch Committee. He put this in various terms, including rank, experience, and the structure of each agency's organization. He pointed out that each agency representative in the Center is isolated to the sole problem of indications, whereas, in his opinion, each agency's Watch Committee member should be able to see intelligence on a broader scope. He said that without this differential, the Watch Committee members would be no better informed than the Working Group members, with consequent loss to the entire watch effort.

He pointed out that General Willems, the present Watch Committee Chairman, as Deputy AC of S, G-2, is informed on the broad picture, and therefore would not react to an individual item which seen in the context of over-all intelligence was of no consequence.

The CHAIRMAN suggested that the Committee members consider General Lewis' remarks and be prepared to discuss them at the next meeting.

He said that he presumed all IAC agencies would participate in the Watch Committee, and asked the Ad Hoc Committee members if any of their agencies felt that they should not be represented on the Watch Committee. On receiving no comments, he stated that the Watch Committee should then be composed of representatives from all IAC organizations, and asked if it was the Committee's concept that the agency supplying the Chairman would supply a member in addition.

DR. REICHARDT outlined the composition and method of operation of the IAC.

CAPTAIN ELLER said that it was desirable that the Chairman be the most senior member.

GENERAL WILLEMS cautioned against any wording that would result in the IAC selecting an agency's representative when naming a Chairman.

GENERAL LEWIS offered to submit a new draft dealing with composition and membership for consideration at the next Ad Hoc Committee meeting.

The CHAIRMAN accepted this offer for the Committee.

He asked for comments on the rate of progress being made by the Ad Hoc Committee, and recalled the decision made at the first meeting to the effect that the Committee should not consider itself under heavy time pressure and

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

CONFIDENTIAL

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

should, therefore, move forward with deliberation and caution. It was the sense of the meeting that satisfactory progress was being made and that the Committee should continue as it was going.

MR. TRUEHEART recalled the concept of a world-wide indications system.

GENERAL LEWIS said that he had given considerable thought to this problem and at the appropriate time would recommend that representatives from all theaters be brought to Washington for discussions with the Ad Hoc Committee. He said that he felt that it was absolutely vital that individuals in the theaters be geared into the Washington mechanism and that he knew of no service that the Ad Hoc Committee could perform that would be as mutually beneficial.

CAPTAIN ELLER asked if this was a duty of the Ad Hoc Committee, or something the Ad Hoc Committee should recommend be done by others.

GENERAL LEWIS felt this should be done by the Ad Hoc Committee so as not to lose the impetus that exists in the Committee nor the knowledge and experience that has developed through Committee deliberations. His only exception was if someone could be found who could do it better.

The CHAIRMAN agreed that the development of a world-wide concept was a responsibility of the Ad Hoc Committee.

CAPTAIN ELLER stated that he would like to submit an alternate version of a Preamble for the Terms of Reference.

The SECRETARY distributed to each member a copy of Navy's "Suggested Version of Preamble for Watch Committee Terms of Reference."

The CHAIRMAN proposed that the Navy suggestion be taken up at the next Ad Hoc Committee meeting.

There being no further business to come before the Committee, the meeting adjourned at 12:35 p.m.

AHIC(W)-M-11
29 January 1954

CONFIDENTIAL